

Literature Review Evaluation of Fieldwork Practice Programs in Vocational High Schools in Indonesia

Riyan Yuliyanto^{*1}, Andi Adam Rahmanto²

^{1,2} Master In Economic Education, Sebelas Maret University, Kota Surakarta, Jawa Tengah 57126
Corresponding Author: riyan.yuliyanto@student.uns.ac.id

Abstract

In an effort to maintain and improve the quality of Vocational High School (SMK) graduates and reduce misses from the demands of the industrial world and technological advances, the government has tried to implement various policies both in terms of quantity and quality. The activities of students in an effort to increase skill competence are through Field Work Practice (PKL) activities that involve the world of work directly. But in fact, according to nationwide data from the Central Statistics Agency (BPS), in February 2023, unemployment for vocational school graduates reached 9.6%, which is the largest of the overall levels of education in Indonesia. This literature review provides a summary of the results of the PKL program evaluation by applying the Context, Input, Process, Product (CIPP) evaluation model. The results of this study prove that the program is running in accordance with the objectives with good output. However, there needs to be careful preparation and seriousness from schools and learners.

Keywords: Fieldwork practice, vocational school, CIPP

Abstrak

Sebagai upaya menjaga dan meningkatkan mutu lulusan Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan (SMK) serta mengurangi miss match dari tuntutan dunia industri dan kemajuan teknologi, pemerintah telah berusaha menerapkan berbagai kebijakan baik dari segi kuantitas maupun kualitas. Kegiatan peserta didik dalam upaya peningkatan kompetensi keahlian adalah melalui kegiatan Praktik Kerja Lapangan (PKL) yang melibatkan dunia kerja secara langsung. Namun pada kenyataannya, secara nasional data Badan Pusat Statistik (BPS) Februari 2023, pengangguran lulusan SMK mencapai 9,6%, ini terbesar dari keseluruhan tingkatan pendidikan di Indonesia. Tinjauan literatur ini memberikan rangkuman hasil evaluasi program PKL dengan menerapkan model evaluasi Context, Input, Process, Product (CIPP). Hasil penelitian ini membuktikan bahwa program ini berjalan sesuai dengan tujuan dengan output yang baik. Namun demikian, perlu adanya persiapan yang matang dan keseriusan dari sekolah maupun peserta didik.

Kata Kunci: Praktik Kerja Lapangan, SMK, CIPP

INTRODUCTION

Southeast Asia and Africa since 2003 have entered the era of Free Trade, where the business world, as the owner and user of labor, requires workers who have the competence to compete in the era of Free Trade. The formation of a professional workforce must be established through educational programs that are in accordance with the needs of employment. Educational institutions are expected to produce qualified graduates through the development of ecology, culture, and skills needed to face global competition (Suryahadikusumah et al., 2022). Schools as official institutions, especially at the vocational high school level, must be able to produce graduates who are competent in certain

competencies (Ardiani, 2020). Vocational High School is one of the levels of formal education at the upper secondary level that specializes in vocational learning activities between three to four years that prepare students to be ready to work in certain fields. In Indonesia, SMK is currently organized by the government and also by the private sector. Currently, Vocational High School Education consists of several areas of expertise competence, namely technology, business management, tourism, agriculture, shipping, hospitality, and so on.

SMK is an educational institution that aims to prepare students after graduation to be able to immediately get a job in accordance with the competence of their skills. Some industries provide an evaluation of the competence of graduates of vocational high school students, including (1) learning materials in schools that must be relevant to the industrial world. (2) the material given to students is too much; so much material still needs to be completed. (3) Vocational High School graduates need more time to be ready to work in industry (Hakiki et al., 2020; Inderanata & Sukardi, 2023). Problems that arise due to a lack of competency skills in students are needed, and program adjustments in vocational high schools are needed in order to be in harmony with the industrial world.

One of the programs issued by the government in the vocational high school curriculum is the fieldwork practice program, whose main objective is to familiarize and prepare students to enter the workforce. With the fieldwork practice program, learners can measure and apply the material obtained at school to the reality that exists in the world of work (Evenda & Lapisa, 2020). Nationwide data from the Central Statistics Agency (BPS) shows that in February 2023, unemployment for vocational school graduates reached 9.6%, which is the largest of the overall levels of education in Indonesia. This is certainly an irony because it is not in accordance with the purpose of vocational school.

In an effort to maintain and improve the quality of vocational graduates and reduce mismatches from the demands of the industrial world and technological advances, the government has tried to implement various policies in terms of both quantity and quality. The activities of students in an effort to improve their competence of expertise are through fieldwork practice activities that involve the world of work directly. Fieldwork practice is carried out when students are in Class X and XI, and it is related to where the practice can be done in small-scale industries as well as national and international industries.

PKL is part of a dual system education program implemented as a cooperation program between SMK and DUDI in the form of training directly in the workplace or practices carried out in the industrial world by applying the knowledge and skills possessed. PKL is a program organized by formal education, especially competencies and majors, that are organized and aligned with programs run by schools and competency programs by fielding students directly at DUDI with guidance so that students have more professional skills (Directorate of Vocational Schools, 2023). Permendikbud RI No. 50 of 2020 regarding street vendors for students is learning for students by implementing work practices in

the world of work at a certain period in accordance with the curriculum. It is needed in the world of work, which has the aim of developing competence, character, and work culture, as well as the independent nature of students to be ready to work.

Programs that aim to improve the skills of vocational school graduates need to be evaluated. Evaluation of educational programs is an activity in the form of monitoring and adjustment processes desired by the evaluator team in order to determine or maintain and improve the quality of education. An evaluation activity can result in knowing how well a program is running effectively and how to improve it. Only now has the article published evaluating this program been published in a small scope, and no one has tried to collect in a literature study the evaluation carried out by previous research. Therefore, this article provides a summary of the results of the PKL program evaluation through a literature study.

METHOD

The method used is a descriptive qualitative literature study used to apply the evaluation model of Context, Input, Process, Product (CIPP) developed by Stufflebeam and Shinkfield in 1985. The CIPP evaluation Model is a comprehensive framework to guide the evaluation of programs, projects, personnel, products, institutions, and systems (Stufflebeam, 2007). The CIPP evaluation Model has principles to improve the quality of a program that is run, not just to prove the success or failure of the program (Doyok, 2021). Therefore, the CIPP evaluation model is an alternative to the evaluation of fieldwork practice programs in Vocational High Schools because this model is not only seen from the success of the program but also to improve the quality and quantity of a program.

The literature study method used to evaluate the program using this CIPP model. This method is used by reviewing various related literature, which is then analyzed and evaluated with CIPP model stages. The following table is the grid used in evaluating the PKL program.

Table 1. Evaluation Grid of PKL Program Through CIPP Model

Assessment Aspects	Data Sources
Context Variables	
Purpose of PKL program	Studi literatur
Neighborhood street vendors	
Street vendors in accordance with the curriculum	
Variable Input	
Readiness of learners in the implementation of street vendors	Studi literatur
Availability of debriefing materials	
Realization of curriculum implementation	
Process Variables	
Placement of learners according to competence	Studi literatur
Implementation of monitoring	
Involvement of learners in the work process in the industry	
Product Variables	
Improvement in competence mastery	Studi literatur

Some of the previous research that became a reference in the evaluation of this fieldwork practice program are as follows:

Table 2. Previous Research that Became a Reference

Author	Sample	Location
Neliwati, Khairani, Sonia Purba Tambak (2023)	Areas Of Expertise Business And Management	SMK Swasta Al Washliyah 9 Perbaungan Sumatera Utara
Lisa Ardiani, Ridwan (2020)	All majors (Fashion, Cuisine, makeup, Multimedia, and Industrial Electronics Engineering)	SMK Negeri 6 Bungo Jambi
Arfin Juri, Hasan Maksum, Wawan Purwanto, Eko Indrawan (2021)	Building modeling and Information Design Program	SMK Negeri 2 Padangsidempuan Tapanuli Selatan
Hendi Firdaus & Nurul Anriani (2022)	Automotive Expertise Program	SMKN 4 Kota Serang
Siti Toyibatun Khasanah, Supriyoko Supriyoko, Samsi Haryanto (2019)	Ototronic Engineering Study Program	SMK Taman Karya Madya Pertambangan Kebumen
Daniel Jesayanto Jaya , Arif Muhammad Yusuf, Nur Lailatur Rahmah (2023)	Building Engineering Expertise Program	SMK N 1 Seyegan dan SMK N 2 Depok Sleman
Maman Paturahman, Irwan Siagian, Chadis (2019)	Financial Accounting Expertise Competence	SMK PGRI 16 Jakarta
Erni Asmarayani, Rusmono, Henita Rahmayanti (2020)	Department Of Furniture Engineering	SMK Negeri di DKI Jakarta
Tarmidi, Wasitohadi, Bambang Ismanto (2020)	All majors (electrical power installation engineering, Machining, Industrial Mechanical Maintenance, automotive light vehicles, and Multimedia)	SMK Saraswati Salatiga
Siti Sahara (2021)	Good communication and interpersonal skills	SMK Negeri 6 Kota Bekasi

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Evaluation of Context

According to Law No. 20 of 2023 on the National Education System, Article 15 related to vocational education is secondary education that prepares students, especially to work in certain fields. Presidential Instruction No. 9 of 2016 on vocational revitalization emphasizes the role and function of the ministry in order to improve the quality and competitiveness of human resources, especially vocational graduates. One of the vocational learning that supports improving the quality of students is street vendors.

In general, PKL is an implementation of the dual system of education that the Indonesian government is trying to adopt in developing education in Indonesia. The purpose of this PKL is to develop the character and professional work culture in students, improve the competence of students according to the curriculum and the needs of the world of work, and prepare the independence of students to work and entrepreneurship.

PKL is the real embodiment of Link and matches SMK with the world of work. PKL is a form of student learning that is carried out in the world of work to hone and strengthen competencies in accordance with the field that aims to provide a real experience for students. In order to prepare vocational school students to plunge into the world of work at Permendikbud number 50 of 2020 regarding fieldwork practices for students, fieldwork practices (PKL) is learning for students of vocational high schools (SMK)/Madrasah Aliyah Kejuruan (MAK) which is carried out through work practices in the world of work within a certain period in accordance with the curriculum and work needs. Furthermore, in Kepmendikbudristek number 262/M/2022 regarding changes to Kepmendikbudristek number 56/M/2022 regarding guidelines for implementing curricula in the framework of learning recovery, which was later called The Independent curriculum, it was determined that street vendors were one of the subjects as a vehicle for learning in the world of work (including teaching factories).

PKL subjects are carried out in the education unit and the world of work. In accordance with the provisions of the Ministry of Education and Culture and Technology, SMK/MAK, together with partners in the world of work, are obliged to make learning plans that include learning objectives (TP), learning goal flow (ATP), and learning planning in accordance with learning achievement (CP) in the decision of the head of the Ministry of Education Standards, Curriculum, and Assessment Agency number 033/H/KR/2022. In the CP, it was emphasized that PKL is the final alignment or culmination of all subjects at the vocational level. PKL learning is organized based on Business Processes and follows Standard Operating Procedures (POS) that apply in the world of work.

Evaluation of the PKL program on context variables that has been done in several previous studies showed various results. Research (Ardiani & Ridwan, 2020; Khasanah et al., 2019; Asmarayani et al., 2020) showed excellent and effective results. However, it is inversely proportional to research (Firdaus & Anriani, 2022), which shows that the category could be better. This is because there is a need to improve the objectives of the Parker program and synchronize the curriculum in schools with industry. According to Sahara (2021), for the needs of the industrial world in carrying out fieldwork practices, the number of PKL participants with the number of MoUs provided by the school must be balanced. This is important because the MoU curriculum between the school and DUDI can be synchronized well.

Input Evaluation

In the Independent curriculum, street vendors are subjects that must be followed by all vocational students with a provision of at least six months (792 lesson hours) in Class XII in the 3-year

vocational program and at least ten months (1,368 lesson hours) in class XIII in the 4-year vocational program. The implementation time of street vendors in the world of work is an agreement between the vocational school and the world of work. The implementation of street vendors in 6 or 10 months can use a rotating training system, Training Rotation System (TRS), or other appropriate training system. Rotation can be done in 1 (One) world of work and various worlds of work in accordance with the learning achievement and agreed upon by the education unit with the world of work.

The implementation of street vendors should be oriented to the interests of school-age students. Street vendors should not be held on public holidays, except for the world of work related to public services. If the PKL place imposes a shift system, PKL students are not allowed to be assigned to the night shift. However, the implementation of street vendors is still determined based on learning planning. Suppose the job characteristics require students to work at these times. In that case, a cooperation agreement between the education unit and the world of work is needed to ensure the safety of street vendors and their health.

PKL is carried out based on planning the placement of students and their implementation in the world of work. The implementation of street vendors is a learning process in the world of work by applying theory and practice in schools. Learners carry out work practices directly based on program agreements with the guidance and direction of street vendor instructors and mentoring by street vendor mentors. Implementation time can be set with various models, such as day release or block release (week release, month release, and quarter).

Debriefing is carried out in two forms, namely regular learning and debriefing before departure. Regular learning is prepared by all intra and co-curricular subjects carried out in Classes X and XI. The debriefing before departure is planned specifically by the school and the world of work. The PKL debriefing Program given to students aims to provide an understanding of the learning activities that must be carried out by students at the time of PKL. The briefing material for the work orientation period can be adjusted to the applicable regulations at the institutions where participants carry out street vendors which include and are not limited to the following: (a) characteristics of work culture in the world of work; (b) work rules in the world of work; (c) orientation of the sociocultural Environment (d) health, safety and Environment; (e) survey of street vendors' locations; (f) preparation of daily activity reports and final reports; and (g) final assessment.

Evaluation of the PKL program on input variables that has been done in several previous studies showed various results. Research (Ardiani & Ridwan, 2020; Jaya et al., 2023; Khasanah et al., 2019; Asmarayani et al., 2020) showed that the achievement of PKL program input variables had a very good category. At the same time, different results were shown in the study (Firdaus & Anriani, 2022), where the input aspect in the implementation of street vendors was included in the bad category. According to him, there is a need for better debriefing so that students are better prepared to work practice programs in the industry. Then (Juri et al., 2021; Sahara, 2021), the input variables in the research in the category

are sufficient because there is no implementation curriculum whose constituent is the result of the cooperation of the school with the industry and the participation of guidance teachers in preparing students.

Evaluation Process

The school identifies the world of work based on the need for concentration of expertise and its potential as a place for street vendors. Furthermore, the school conducts an assessment of the world of work to determine the potential for cooperation between street vendors. At the time of implementation of street vendors, placement of students in the world of work should be based on the script of cooperation. The basis for the placement of PKL participants is the availability of competence in the position and type of work as well as the capacity of the working world where PKL. The placement of learners should be in accordance with the concentration of expertise. To maintain the quality of the implementation of street vendors, placement is also based on the suitability of potential learners with the work to be carried out in the world of street vendors. The education unit must carry out mapping of students and the world of work where street vendors and assign street vendors mentors, while the world of work determines street vendors' instructors.

Instructor world of work monitoring and assessment of street vendors. The purpose of this mentoring is as a means of internalizing the job duties given to street vendors in the world of work. Mentoring activities may include some of the following. (a) provide an example of the implementation of the values of the cultural character of the world of work; (b) respond to information and problems of students in the implementation of street vendors; and (c) serve the consultation of students related to the implementation of street vendors in the world of work. During the implementation of street vendors, guidance teachers can conduct online or offline monitoring, which includes:

1. suitability of placement of students in the world of work with the concentration of expertise,
2. compliance with the implementation of fieldwork practices with the PKL work plan, and
3. coordination with the world of work instructors related to mastery of learners' competencies.

Evaluation of the PKL program on process variables that has been done in several previous studies showed various results. Research (Ardiani & Ridwan, 2020; Juri et al., 2021; Khasanah et al., 2019; Jaya et al., 2023) shows effective results because the process in the PKL program is fulfilled and the aspect is high regarding problems in the implementation in the industry, a needs analysis needs to be done so that before the implementation of the fieldwork practice Program gets the right information about the needs of the industry. Constraint factors in the fieldwork practice program include communication relationship constraints between the school and the industry, as well as the need for competence of students in productive subjects.

Product Evaluation

After the implementation of PKL, PKL participants will be assessed to determine the learning achievement that has been achieved during the implementation of PKL. PKL assessment refers to the Assessment Guide and assessment. Assessment components can be:

1. Instructor assessment,
2. Teacher assessment,
3. Street vendors report, and
4. Presentation of street vendor reports at school or the world of work.

Evaluation of the PKL program has been done several previous studies on the product variables as a whole as a result of previous research (neliwati et al., 2023; Ardiani & Ridwan, 2020; Juri et al., 2021; Khasanah et al.; 2019; Jaya et al., 2023; Paturahman et al., 2019; Asmarayani et al., 2020; Tarmidi et al., 2020; Sahara, 2021;), obtained effective results with the results of the assessment of students after carrying out street vendors exceeding KKM, and changes in attitudes and competencies that occur in students. Different results were shown (Firdaus & Anriani, 2022), where the competence of learners after prakerin has remained the same. This is due to the process of context and input that has yet to be maximized. According to him, there is a need to change the mindset of students that Parker is not just carrying out school obligations; more than that, it is an activity to improve competence and seek experience in preparation for entering the workforce.

Application of street vendors in Indonesia

The following is a table of evaluation results of the street vendors program based on the CIPP model from previous research:

Table 3. Evaluation of Previous Research

Author	Evaluation Results			
	Context	Input	Process	Product
Neliwati, Khairani, Sonia Purba Tambak (2023)	Good	Good	Good	Good
Lisa Ardianil, Ridwan (2020)	Very Good	Very Good	Very Good	Good
Arfin Juri, Hasan Maksum, Wawan Purwanto, Eko Indrawan (2021)	Good	Cukup	Very Good	Very Good
Hendi Firdaus & Nurul Anriani (2022)	Not Good	Not Good	Enough	Not Good
Siti Toyibatun Khasanah, Supriyoko Supriyoko, Samsi Haryanto (2019)	Very Good	Very Good	Very Good	Very Good
Daniel Jesayanto Jaya , Arif Muhammad Yusuf, Nuur Lailatur Rahmah (2023)	Very Good	Very Good	Very Good	Good
Maman Paturahman, Irwan Siagian, Chadis (2019)	Good	Good	Good	Good
Erni Asmarayani, Rusmono, Henita Rahmayanti (2020)	Very Good	Very Good	Good	Very Good

Tarmidi, Wasitohadi, Bambang Ismanto (2020)	Good	Good	Good	Good
Siti Sahara (2021)	Good	Enough	Good	Good

Based on the previous literature, many have proved that the Field Work Practice program for Vocational High School students is running in accordance with the objectives with good output. However, this is inversely proportional to the unemployment data in Indonesia based on the level of education, where vocational school graduates have dominated in terms of unemployment in recent years. Related to this, the authors suggest that future research looks for the problem of unemployment of vocational school graduates by adding street vendors as a variable of mediation or moderation.

CONCLUSION

Evaluation of the PKL program can be carried out by the education unit independently or together with the world of work partners against students who run the PKL program. Evaluation materials include: Context (objectives, environment, and curriculum), Input (readiness, debriefing, and realization of curriculum implementation), Process (placement according to competence, monitoring, and involvement of learners), Product/output (competency improvement).

RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations for the implementation of fieldwork practice programs to run effectively and reduce the unemployment rate of vocational school graduates in the future, several things can be taken into consideration for the future, including:

1. In preparation for street vendors, the school should invite and ask DUDI couples to provide street vendor material to students directly in accordance with their expertise and competence.
2. Guidance teachers are given programs or opportunities to improve themselves either with seminars or training about the business world and the industrial world.
3. Schools can cooperate with DUDI in updating the latest materials in accordance with the progress of the times so that students become more enthusiastic about learning and working.
4. Monitoring and evaluation should be done with a frequency that is not too long.
5. The education unit can pass the MoU with DUDI in order to distribute the best graduates in DUDI.

The implementation of this recommendation is expected to improve the quality of vocational school graduates and reduce the unemployment rate in the future.

REFERENCES

- Ardiani, L. (2020). Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Program Praktek Kerja Industri (Prakerin). *Jurnal Imiah Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*, 4(2), 194-200. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jipp.v4i2.25300>
- Asmarayani, E., & Rahmayanti, H. (2020). Evaluasi Program Pelaksanaan Praktek Kerja Lapangan (PKL) Program Keahlian Teknik Furnitur pada SMK Negeri DI DKI Jakarta. *Jurnal Pendidikan Teknik dan Vokasional*, 3(2), 101-120. <https://doi.org/10.21009/JPTV.3.2.101>
- Direktorat SMK. (2023). *Panduan Praktik Kerja Lapangan Sebagai Mata Pelajaran Dalam Implementasi Kurikulum Merdeka*. Jakarta: Direktur Jenderal Pendidikan Vokasi. https://smkpk.ditpsmk.net/dokumen/NPK_PKL_Sebagai_Mata_Pelajaran_19_Juni_2023.pdf
- Doyok, R. (2021). Model evaluasi CIPP dalam mengevaluasi program tahfiz selama daring di SMP Islam Al-Ishlah Bukittinggi. *Ideas: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, dan Budaya*, 7(3), 73-82. [10.32884/ideas.v7i3.429](https://doi.org/10.32884/ideas.v7i3.429)
- Evenda, D., & Lapisa, R. (2020). Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Program Praktek Kerja Industri pada Kompetensi Keahlian Nautika Kapal Niaga. *Jurnal Imiah Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*, 4(1), 128-138. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jipp.v4i1.24172>
- Hakiki, M., Putra, Y. I., & Ridoh, A. (2020). Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Program Praktek Kerja Industri Siswa Kelas XI di Smk Negeri 3 Payakumbuh Tahun Ajaran 2017/2018. *Jurnal Inovasi Pendidikan dan Teknologi Informasi (JIPTI)*, 1(1), 16-24. <https://dx.doi.org/10.52060/pti.v1i1.300>
- Inderanata, R. N., & Sukardi, T. (2023). Investigation study of integrated vocational guidance on work readiness of mechanical engineering vocational school students. *Heliyon*, 9(2), e13333. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e13333>
- Jaya, D. J., Yusuf, A. M., & Rahmah, N. L. (2023). Evaluasi Implementasi Praktik Kerja Lapangan (PKL) Siswa SMK Program Keahlian Teknik Bangunan di Kabupaten Sleman. *Jurnal Pembelajaran Inovatif*, 6(1), 25-34. <https://doi.org/10.21009/JPI.061.04>
- Neliwati, N., Khairani, K., & Tambak, S. P. (2023). Evaluasi Pengelolaan Program Praktik Kerja Lapangan (PKL) Kelas XI SMK Bidang Keahlian Bisnis dan Manajemen. *Reslaj: Religion Education Social Laa Roiba Journal*, 5(4), 2285-2313. <https://doi.org/10.47467/reslaj.v5i4.2907>
- Sahara, S. (2021). Evaluasi Program Praktik Kerja Lapangan Kompetensi Keahlian Tekniik Pendingin dan Tata Udara Se-Kota Bekasi. *Jurnal Pendidikan Teknik dan Vokasional*, 4(2), 64-73. <https://doi.org/10.21009/JPTV.4.2.64>

- Siagian, I., Paturahman, M., & Chadis, C. (2019). Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Program Praktik Kerja Industri Kompetensi Keahlian Akuntansi Keuangan Lembaga Pada Smk Pgri 16 Jakarta. *Faktor: Jurnal Ilmiah Kependidikan*, 6(3), 223-234. <http://dx.doi.org/10.30998/fjik.v6i3.4255>
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (2007). *CIPP evaluation model checklist*.
- Suryahadikusumah, A. R., Harum, A., & Prabiastuti, H. Y. (2022). A Construct Validity Of The Transferable Skills Scale For Assessment Of Career Guidance. *Bisma The Journal of Counseling*, 6(3), 371–378. <https://doi.org/10.23887/bisma.v6i3.52955>
- Tarmidi, T., & Ismanto, B. (2020). Evaluasi Program Praktek Kerja Industri Di SMK Saraswati Salatiga. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Humaniora*, 9(1), 138-145. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jish-undiksha.v9i1.24751>